

BOURNEMOUTH, CHRISTCHURCH AND POOLE COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE

Minutes of the Meeting held on 02 October 2023 at 10.00 am

Present:-

Cllr M Le Poidevin – Chair

Cllr P Hilliard – Vice-Chair

Present: Cllr P Canavan (In place of Cllr G Martin), Cllr S Carr-Brown, Cllr J Clements, Cllr B Dove (In place of Cllr C Adams), Cllr D A Flagg, Cllr M Gillett, Cllr B Hitchcock, Cllr Dr F Rice, Cllr K Salmon, Cllr P Sidaway, Cllr M Tarling and Cllr L Williams (In place of Cllr J Challinor)

52. Apologies

Apologies were received from Cllr C Adams, Cllr J Challinor and Cllr G Martin.

53. Substitute Members

Cllr P Canavan substituted for Cllr G Martin, Cllr B Dove substituted for Cllr C Adams and Cllr L Williams substituted for Cllr J Challinor.

54. Declarations of Interests

Members declared the following interests:

Agenda Item 5a, Land South of Gillett Road

Declarations precluding committee members from speaking and voting:

Cllr M Gillett declared that he was pre-determined in respect of this application and would not speak or vote as a committee member. He was able to speak in his capacity as a ward councillor in accordance with the provisions of the public speaking protocol.

Cllr M Tarling explained that he had been unable to complete the committee site visit on 29 September 2023 and therefore could not take part in this item in accordance with the Site Visit Protocol. He did not speak or vote and left the meeting room for the duration of the item.

Other declarations for transparency:

Cllr B Dove declared that in her role as a councillor she had been in meetings in the same room as the Chairman and Chief Executive of Talbot Village Trust, this had been in a professional capacity only with no pecuniary interest involved.

Cllr K Salmon declared that since before becoming a councillor she had been a member of a Talbot Heath Facebook group where opinions about this matter had been expressed. She had not expressed any opinions and remained completely open minded and did not believe this represented a conflict of interest. She confirmed when asked by the Chair that she was satisfied that she was not predetermined in any way.

Cllr P Hilliard declared that he was a governor of Highcliffe School and a trustee of the Mudeford Wood and Somerford ARC community centres, all of which had received grants from Talbot Village Trust. He also declared that he was a BCP Council appointed governor of University Hospitals Dorset NHS Foundation Trust but had no involvement regarding this application.

Cllr M Le Poidevin declared that she belonged to a church which had received grants from Talbot Village Trust but had no predetermination.

Cllr Dr F Rice declared that she was involved in the Poverty Truth Commission which had received funds from Talbot Village Trust.

In response to a councillor enquiry the Senior Solicitor advised that a person with private health insurance would not be affected by the decision on this application to such a degree as to constitute a pecuniary interest.

Agenda Items 5b/5c, St Ann's Hospital

Cllr K Salmon declared that as her husband worked for the applicant, Dorset Healthcare University NHS Foundation Trust, she would not speak or vote and left the meeting room for the duration of the item.

Cllr P Hilliard declared for transparency that he was a BCP Council appointed governor of University Hospitals Dorset NHS Foundation Trust but had no involvement regarding this application.

55. Public Issues

The Chair advised that there were a number of requests to speak on planning applications as detailed under individual items below.

In relation to the planning application for Land South of Gillett Road, Poole, the Chair exercised discretion to allow a maximum combined time of fifteen minutes to speak in objection with up to five persons speaking within the fifteen minutes and a further maximum combined time of fifteen minutes to speak in support with up to five persons speaking within the fifteen minutes.

56. Schedule of Planning Applications

The Committee considered planning application reports, copies of which had been circulated and which appear as Appendices A to C to these minutes in the Minute Book. A Committee Addendum Sheet was published on 29 September 2023 and appears as Appendix D to these minutes. The Committee considered the planning applications in the order set out below:

57. St Anns Hospital, 69 Haven Road, Poole, BH13 7LN (APP/23/00168/L)

Canford Cliffs Ward

APP/23/00168/L

Listed building application for the demolition of existing buildings and erection of a hospital building comprising bedrooms with amenity space, communal, support and staff facilities, generator reconfiguration and associated works.

The Development Management Manager provided an update to the Committee, explaining that although reports on both applications for St Ann's Hospital had been published with the agenda, only the planning application APP/23/00167/F needed a committee decision due to the finely balanced considerations involved. There were a number of issues with the listed building application report for APP/23/00168/L and as this application did not require a committee decision, he had contacted the Chair and Vice Chair who had indicated their support for withdrawing the application from the agenda, subject to the Committee's agreement.

RESOLVED that the listed building application APP/23/00168/L be withdrawn from the agenda

Voting: Unanimous

58. Land South of Gillett Road, Talbot Village, Poole BH3 7AH

Talbot and Branksome Woods Ward

APP/22/01455/F

Major hybrid application for: Full application for the construction of a new 11,606 sq. metre Nuffield Health Hospital with provision of access, servicing and car parking, cycle and pedestrian provision and landscaping, Outline planning application for the provision of 13,394 sq. metre of employment, healthcare and university-related floorspace, including ancillary uses and a Growing Hub, and Change of Use of 12 hectares of grazing land to create a Heathland Support Area for the lifetime of the Innovation Quarter.

Public Representations

Objectors

- ❖ Stephen Chappell
- ❖ Dr Martin Price, representing East Dorset Friends of the Earth

- ❖ Sheila Warner, representing Talbot and Branksome Woods Residents Association
- ❖ Jo Keeling, Chairman of Talbot Village Residents Association
- ❖ Nick Dobbs

Applicant/Supporters

- ❖ Nick Ashley Cooper, Chairman of Talbot Village Trust
- ❖ David McNair, Nuffield Health

Ward Councillors (in objection)

- ❖ Cllr Philip Broadhead
- ❖ Cllr Matthew Gillett
- ❖ Cllr Karen Rampton

Other Councillors (in objection)

- ❖ Cllr Olivia Brown
- ❖ Cllr Richard Herrett
- ❖ Cllr Tony Trent

RESOLVED that planning permission be REFUSED contrary to the Officer's recommendation for the following reasons (final wording of reasons to be delegated to the Head of Planning to agree in consultation with the Chair):

Contrary to the following Policies of the Poole Local Plan (2018):

PP32 Poole's nationally, European and internationally important sites

which states that 'Development will only be permitted where it would not lead to an adverse effect upon the integrity, either alone or in combination, directly or indirectly, on nationally, European and internationally important sites'.

The Committee was concerned that the development could attract new people to/within close range of the protected heathland.

PP35 A safe, connected and accessible transport network

There is an overprovision of car parking to that stated in the current adopted BCP Parking Standards Supplementary Planning Document (SPD) and thereby the development is not in accordance with Policy PP35 which requires that developments accord with the Parking & Highway Layout in New Development SPD. The Parking SPD is a material consideration and a departure needs to be justified.

The Committee did not find that there was adequate justification for departing from the SPD in relation to this application.

PP24 (2) (b) and (c) Green infrastructure

'(2) New development

New development should protect and strengthen the green infrastructure network by:

(b) connecting together and enrich biodiversity and wildlife habitats;

(c) improving connections, green corridors and links between different components of the green infrastructure network;’

The Committee agreed that the development did not sufficiently protect green infrastructure in relation to the above sections of the Policy.

PP21 3(c) Talbot Village

3) Transport

Development at Talbot Village will help to deliver significant improvement of transport and movement to the area by, where appropriate:

(c) providing a level of car parking designed to encourage access to the campus by walking, cycling and public transport

The Committee agreed that the development did not encourage this section of the policy

The Committee agreed that there should also be included reasons for refusal to address the absence of any s106 agreement to secure the planning obligations identified as necessary in the report.

Voting:

At the request of the required number of members the Committee took a recorded vote on the above resolution which was carried as follows:

For: 8

Cllrs P Canavan, S Carr-Brown, B Dove, B Hitchcock, Dr F Rice, K Salmon, P Sidaway, L Williams

Against: 4

Cllrs J Clements, D Flagg, P Hilliard and M Le Poidevin

Abstain: 0

Notes:

A proposal to grant the application was moved and seconded prior to the resolution to refuse the application. At the request of the required number of members the Committee took a recorded vote which was NOT carried as follows:

Voting:

For: 4

Cllrs J Clements, D Flagg, P Hilliard and M Le Poidevin

Against: 8

Cllrs P Canavan, S Carr-Brown, B Dove, B Hitchcock, Dr F Rice, K Salmon, P Sidaway, L Williams

Abstain: 0

At the end of this item, Cllrs B Dove, K Salmon, P Sidaway and L Williams left the meeting and Cllrs M Gillett and M Tarling rejoined for the following item.

59. St Anns Hospital, 69 Haven Road, Poole, BH13 7LN (APP/23/00167/F)

Canford Cliffs Ward

APP/23/00167/F

Demolition of existing buildings and erection of a hospital building comprising bedrooms with amenity space, communal, support and staff facilities, generator reconfiguration, and associated works.

Public Representations

Objectors

- ❖ Derek Naylor, Director of Chaddesley Grange Management Company Ltd

Applicant/Supporters

- ❖ Dawn Dawson, on behalf of the applicant

Ward Councillors

- ❖ None registered

RESOLVED that planning permission be GRANTED in accordance with the recommendation set out in the Officer's report as updated by the Committee Addendum Sheet.

Voting: Unanimous

The meeting ended at 3.16 pm

CHAIR